A journalist in Emile Zola’s novel Nana describes its unrestrained heroine as a “golden fly” who spreads social rot, “corrupting and deranging Paris between her snowy thighs.”1 The same might be said of Nana. In the decades after its 1880 release, an epidemic of “Nana figures,” sexually and economically independent women who, like Nana, straddled the line between stage performance and prostitution, appeared in fiction from North America to East Asia. As Nana infected the world’s literature, so did the naturalist novel: emerging in France in the 1860s, this variety of European realism had practitioners across the globe by the early twentieth century.

The transnational career of the Nana figure opens questions central to any attempt to create a truly global history of literary form. How does travel assist the extraction of a character from a novel? What role did the Nana figure play in the establishment of realism outside

---


An earlier version of this essay was presented at the American Comparative Literature Association’s 2008 conference at California State University, Long Beach. I would like to thank members of the conference’s “Traveling Discourses” seminar, Marshall Brown, and Jonathan Arac for their comments. Japanese names are in the customary order of surname followed by given name. Authors who adopted a pen name in place of their given name (Kosugi Tengai) are referred to by the pen name on second usage.

Modern Language Quarterly 72:1 (March 2011)
doi 10.1215/00267929-2010-032 © 2011 by University of Washington
Europe? From its beginnings the naturalist novel was entwined with nonfictional genres for representing human psychology and society, from discourse on prostitution to urban reportage, that also circulated around the world. How did their travels assist those of the Nana figure? The plots in which Nana and her sisters appear depend on changes in structures of family and labor that are fundamental to capitalist societies. How did the Nana figure contribute to the gendering of capitalist modernity, a process that unfolded on a transnational scale?²

Answering these questions requires resisting some tendencies in current studies of world literature. The naturalist novel’s close connection to other genres of social thought shows the importance of studying its movements in the context of its “fellow travelers.” To date, most studies in world literature have neglected the broader intellectual context, focusing on the literary alone in an implicit if not intentional retreat from viewing the European novel as a product of both literary and nonliterary discourses.³ When it turns its attention to the movement of forms, recent scholarship largely adopts a model of “diffusion”: radiation outward from the region of origin. Diffusion models have been thoroughly criticized in area studies, particularly because they privilege the source to the point of universalizing it as a standard for measuring “peripheral” adaptations.⁴ In literary studies they stress local encounters with forms assumed to be unchanged by their departure from Europe. In Pascale Casanova’s well-known formulation, peripheral authors adopt European forms intact, with no conscious awareness that the forms are already “outmoded” in terms of the literary “mean time”


established in Paris. As the naturalist novel traveled, however, possibilities only implicit in the French school emerged, along with new tendencies absent in the work of Zola and his French followers. These changes occurred because of the novel's departure from Europe; as transformations not predictable from the source, they would be ruled out in a diffusion model. The history of Nana and her sisters suggests, in contrast, that transformation through movement should be a central focus in efforts to create a properly global history for the novel. As a tendency that takes to an extreme aspects of European realism—from social documentation to the normative dissection of social pathologies—the naturalist novel exemplifies one part of such a history, the travels of realism.

Comparing Nana to later "Nana narratives," including the Japanese writer Kosugi Tengai’s New Year’s Finery (Hatsu sugata) and the American Theodore Dreiser’s Sister Carrie (both 1900), reveals a consistent set of qualities for the Nana figure: performance, contagion, and mobility. These traits emerge as the concepts of society and techniques of representation at work in Nana shift in relation to each other, allowing a transposition of the novel’s dense narrative discourse into aspects of character. The flattening of Nana that results opens the Nana figure to possibilities for social investigation beyond those available in Zola’s novel. Recognizing the transformations that occur through travel demands that one reconsider the role of Nana in the process. If the originality of Nana was to draw existing tendencies in social thought and representation into a constellation that was consequential because it could travel widely, Nana herself may be less the progenitor of the Nana figure than one of its early iterations.

The Birth of the Nana Figure

Anna Coupeau, as Nana was formally named, entered the world in Zola’s 1877 novel L’Assommoir as the daughter of its alcoholic protago-

---


nist, Gervaise Macquart. A girl "who took to vice like a fish to water," Nana shuns a life of petty labor and by the novel's end already has a promising career trading affection for finery. Her career outside Zola's novels began quickly as well: in 1877 Claude Manet exhibited a Nana inspired by Lassommoir. In the painting a woman in petticoats turns her face to the viewer as a top-hatted man gazes avidly from the side. In a characteristic turn in Nana's life, Manet's tableau was the basis of an infamous scene in Nana in which she undresses and caresses herself before a mirror as her lover, Count Muffat, looks on in disheartenment. Kaleidoscopic mediations of Nana continued in the advance publicity for the novel. The launch began in May 1879 with a front-page announcement in the newspaper Le Voltaire of a sequel to Lassommoir and ended with Nana's name plastered across Paris. Nine days before serialization started in October, Le Voltaire published an excerpt in which Muffat reads the article on the golden fly, a mise en abyme that epitomizes her specular existence by offering Muffat's apprehension of the article on Nana as a précis of Nana. Henry Céard wrote to Zola on the eve of the first installment: "There is an enormous curiosity about Nana. The name is on every wall of Paris, as far as the eye can see. It verges on obsession and nightmare" (quoted in Becker, lxxv–lxxvi). Nana's ubiquity created paradoxical uncertainty about her identity. The question frequently posed in the novel itself—"Who is Nana?" (e.g., Zola, Nana, 26–27)—was already bruited in the world.

The curiosity about Nana, which made the novel Zola's most profitable, quickly spread abroad. Between 1880 and 1882 Nana was translated into at least twelve languages: Bengali, Czech, Danish, English, German, modern Greek, Hungarian, Italian, Portuguese, Russian, Spanish, and Swedish (see appendix). By 1911 there were translations in at least five more languages—Armenian, Dutch, Japanese, Turkish, and Yiddish—and numerous retranslations. (Nana was translated into English at least four times by the turn of the century.) Since 1912 the

9 On the publicity campaign see Becker, lxxv–lxxix.
novel has been translated into at least thirty-four more languages, for a minimum of fifty-one in all. The speed of translation reflects the prestige that Zola and French naturalism enjoyed around the world. However, the pattern of Nana’s travels, like those of naturalism, was more complex and contingent than the concentric circles suggested by “diffusion.”

A Bengali publisher, physically distant from European salons, released a translation in the same year that Nana appeared as a volume in France. Because of gaps in copyright protection, competing German editions appeared in Grossenhain and Budapest, while the first American translation of Nana appeared four years before the British. The close eye that writers in Argentina and Brazil kept on developments in France made the impact of Zola and French naturalism especially great in those countries. (A translation appeared in Brazil four years before the first in Portugal.) Critics in countries with a history of realistic fiction that offered an alternative to naturalism, such as Russia and Britain, were especially hostile to Zola’s work. In countries where realist techniques were not well established, in contrast, naturalism’s aggressive assault on romantic and sentimental fiction made it a means to agitate for realism per se.

As the fame of Nana and Nana surged, Zola’s character became a crossover product. In France, “Nana-tomical” caricatures appeared

---


in the press, while a parodic operette, *Nana and Company* (*Nana et cie*), joined the theatrical adaptation written by Zola and William Busnach. Nana’s musical career continued in a “Nana polka” and the comical song “Nana’s Donkey” (“L’âne à Nana”). In Greece Nana’s name was used to sell sweets and hats and to describe a manner of dressing.\(^\text{16}\) In the United States, other novels by Zola were marketed to stress their connection with her. *Nana* appeared there in 1880 with the subtitle *Sequel to “L’assommoir,”* but the renown of Gervaise’s daughter seems to have been so profitable that *L’assommoir* was rereleased with the subtitle *Nana’s Mother* in 1882. When *Germinat* was released in 1885, it was called *Nana’s Brother: Son of “Gervaise”* and *“Lantier” of “L’assommoir.”* The commercial possibilities that Nana offered, all too appropriate in view of her own consumption of goods and men, encouraged the separation of the character from the novel that bore her name.

Some of the most notable derivatives were the *Nana*-inspired works that abounded in the decades after the novel’s publication. From these works, ranging from obvious knockoffs to novels with indirect connections, emerged the Nana figure. Scarcely a week after the start of serialization in *Le Voltaire*, *Le Figaro* published *Nana’s Daughter*, a *Potty-Loving Novel by Mr. Émile Zola* (*La fille à Nana, roman orduraliste par M. Émile Zola*), purportedly the first installment of a story about Nana’s offspring. The author, Albert Millaud, had recognized himself as Zola’s model for Steiner, the lover of Nana’s rival, Rose Mignon (Becker, xxxi, lxxi). In 1880 Cletto Arrighi, an inspiration for Italian naturalists, moved Zola’s heroine south in *Nana in Milan* (*Nanà a Milano*). The novel uses Nana’s several months in the city to criticize the political class of postunification Italy.\(^\text{18}\) The following year Alfred Sirven and Henri Leverdier fol-


\(^{18}\) Cletto Arrighi [Carlo Righerri], *Nanà a Milano* (Milan: Ambrosoli, 1880); Paul Barnaby, “Nana in Milan: Cletto Arrighi and the Italian Reception of Zola,” *New
allowed Millaud’s lead with a full-length pirate sequel, *Nana’s Daughter: A Novel of Parisian Manners* (*La fille de Nana: Roman de moeurs parisiennes*), in a faltering attempt to right the moral conventions that *Nana* inverts. Like the retitled American editions, these early descendants of *Nana* clustered in the branches of the Rougon-Macquart family tree.

Less directly derivative works signaled their ties through references to the character, the novel, and the author. The Croatian novelist Evgenij Kumičić’s *Olga and Lina* (*Olga i Lina*, 1882), the story of a half-Hungarian whore who moves with ease among Germanized aristocrats, includes several scenes modeled on episodes in *Nana*. Its protagonist, Lina, enraths a baron happy to lose his fortune to her; she even kills his wife to take her place. Estella, the central figure of the Spanish novelist Eduardo López Bago’s works *The Prostitute* and *The Pallid Woman* (*La prostituta* and *La pálida*, both 1884), is a girl from the Madrid slums whose virginity is sold to a syphilitic marquis, the secret owner of a chain of brothels. Like Nana, Estella is a vector of corruption in a society enjoying its ruin: when she sleeps with the marquis’s son, who suffers from congenital syphilis, she stimulates the full-blown disease. (In a further reference, the doctor who treats father and son is a devoted reader of Claude Bernard’s *Introduction to the Study of Experimental Medicine* [*Introduction à l’étude de la médecine expérimentale*, 1865], the inspiration for Zola’s theory of the “experimental novel.”) At the heart of “Common Folk” (“Sämre folk,” 1885), by the Finnish novelist Ina Lange, is a half-Russian girl named Nadja, in reflection of her father’s nationality but also, according to Riikka Rossi, in allusion to Nana. After migrating from the southwestern archipelago to Helsinki to work as a servant, Nadja becomes a prostitute and breaks into theater as a choir girl, debasing those around her as she cuts a path to Saint Petersburg and Moscow. When her singing career sours, she takes shelter in

*Comparison*, nos. 35–36 (2003): 163. I am indebted to Barnaby and others for the opportunity to pursue a version of “distant reading” à la Moretti.


a home run by Finnish nationalists, rebuilding a humble life under the Finnophone name Maja. The mutability of her name, which recalls the nonsensical “sing-song vivacity” of Nana’s, highlights her indeterminate social identity.\(^{22}\) The lineage of works inspired by Zola’s heroine extends well into the twentieth century, from the Chilean novelist Augusto D’Halmar’s *Juana Lucero* (1902), whose protagonist renames herself Naná, to Cyprian Ekwensi’s *Jagua Nana* (1961), about a prostitute who aspires to rise in Nigerian society.\(^{23}\)

The examples from Kumičić, López Bago, and Lange reveal several recurring qualities of the Nana figure. She often occupies a position shifting between prostitute and entertainer. Indifferent to procreation and marriage, she knows precisely what the men around her desire. She is commonly described in shades of infection, whether by disease or by sinister influence. She moves unimpeded through the society that made her, underscoring its hypocrisy while taking a blithely unrepentant view of her own behavior. The plots in which she appears frequently serve as social diagnostics—“medical-social novel” is the subtitle of many of López Bago’s works—but plot structures seem unable to solve the riddle of her identity. Instead they restrain her through mechanisms that are remarkably brutal, such as the murder of Estella by the marquis’s son and the nationalist reeducation of Nadja. Typically, she ends up alone, if not dead.

Since the late nineteenth century, when naturalism was most controversial, its opponents have pointed to works like Olga and Lina, “Common Folk,” and López Bago’s pair of novels as evidence of the school’s tendency to produce “slavish” imitations outside France. But while the heroines of these novels recall Nana, her relationship to the Nana figure is not simply cause to effect. The novels in which the Nana figure appears deploy stereotypes of femininity, quasi-scientific ideas of psychology and social behavior, and techniques of representation that are not unique to *Nana*. Although Zola’s inspiration clearly was significant,


the deeper causes of the Nana figure are those that produced Nana itself. Tengai’s New Year’s Finery and Dreiser’s Sister Carrie show, moreover, that Nana narratives transform the ideas and techniques that intersect in the narrative discourse of Nana in ways that raise new possibilities for the character and the analysis of her milieu. The appearance of the Nana figure may show a structural causality on a transnational scale, with variations reflecting the unevenness of the world’s political and economic fabric.

Zola’s Nana

Like many of Zola’s characters, Nana takes shape in a thick weave of theories of society and techniques of social description that mixes empirical observation and normative judgment. Perhaps the most significant strand derives from the surveys of Parisian prostitution that Alexandre Parent-Duchâtelet carried out in the 1820s and 1830s and that became points of reference for new regimes of regulation, debates over the social effects of prostitution, and representations of the prostitute herself. Spending time as a call girl, actress, streetwalker, and well-kept mistress, attracting and destroying men as she goes, Nana personifies one of Parent-Duchâtelet’s greatest fears, that women could move easily in and out of prostitution, introducing acquired vices to honest society. Programs to identify and regulate the activities of sex workers targeted such mobility. (When she is working the streets, Nana narrowly avoids arrest under laws inspired by Parent-Duchâtelet’s work.)

Parent-Duchâtelet’s observations became clichés in the novels and plays about prostitutes that flourished in nineteenth-century France and that made the most evident literary contribution to Nana; Victor Hugo’s Marion de Lorme (1831), Honoré de Balzac’s Cousin Bette (Cousine Bette, 1847), and, closer to the composition of Nana, Joris-Karl Huysmans’s Marthe (1876) and Edmond de Goncourt’s Where Elisa (Fille Elisa, 1877) (Corbin, 5–7; Becker, vi, xxvi–xxviii). Like the typical prostitute in these works, Nana has a childish personality and rejects the values of order and economy, yet she is given to fits of charity and

piety; physically, she shares with the type a plump figure and a squawking voice hardly suited to the stage (Zola, Nana, 35, 71, 317, 386–87, 457; Corbin, 7–9). Zola’s description of the erotic rapport between Nana and her audience also draws on the long-standing association of actresses with prostitution, strengthened by the recent appearance of the café-concert singer, an entertainer who offered sexual services. That Georges, a young man who kills himself after a long infatuation with Nana, first glimpses her on the stage reflects the moral peril that actresses were thought to pose.25

Urban reportage written in the wake of the Commune, such as Charles-Jérôme Lecour’s Prostitution in Paris and London, 1789–1871 (Prostitution à Paris et à Londres, 1789–1871, 1872) and Maxime du Camp’s Paris, Its Organs, Functions, and Life (Paris, ses organes, ses fonctions et sa vie, 1872), magnified prostitution into a problem threatening to engulf society. The connection that Parent-Duchâtelet drew between prostitution and public health suggested an epidemic of physical and moral dimensions (Corbin, 17–24). The sense of menace is clear in Zola’s description of Nana as a gilded vector of disease. The rising incidence of syphilis, transmissible in the womb, compounded the “venereal anxiety” that such works inspired and buttressed another body of thought that shapes Nana: the theories of hereditary degeneration behind the family tree of the Rougon-Macquart novels. In Nana they are glimpsed in characterizations of the heroine as “born of four or five generations of drunks, blood exhausted by a long heredity of poverty and liquor” (Zola, Nana, 224). Thus Nana is made of many of the elements in the medical models of cultural crisis that Robert A. Nye shows proliferated in late-nineteenth-century France.26

Nana has a narrative and symbolic structure more complex than an assembly of theories and empirical observations, as the turn to poetics in Zola criticism since the 1970s has shown.27 Although Zola applied theories of heredity to explain the “unconscious family rancor, passed

27 On the turn to poetics see Naomi Schor, Zola’s Crowds (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1978), xii–xiii.
down in the blood” of Nana toward her patrons (Nana, 447), the conceit of the golden fly also enlists hereditary determinism in a metaphorical employment of social decay. In the novel’s ghastly ending, when Nana dies of smallpox, surrounded by her rivals, the narrator expands the journalist Fauchery’s declaration that Nana poisoned men into the charge that she poisoned “a people” (Zola, Nana, 224–25, 475). Infection becomes a master metaphor for social relations during the Second Empire, with Nana’s mobility coded as both cause and symptom. The infection that Nana spreads already seems pervasive at the novel’s beginning, when the audience responds to her stage debut as if the virus of uncontrollable desire had been passing among its members for some time (Zola, Nana, 26–27, 30–31). The novel’s stress on vision and the visuality of its descriptive language from this scene on identify the viewer—indeed, the reader—as a willing participant in the epidemic. The epidemiological view of social relations is strengthened as social distinctions disappear in the crowd of men around Nana, as female characters increasingly resemble her, and as sexual difference itself begins to break down through Nana’s taste for cross-dressing and sexual escapades with women. The fever that seizes the Parisian crowd as it chants, “To Berlin!” at the novel’s end is only the most explicit example of happily contracted mass infection (Zola, Nana, 462). Nana remains “the central flesh” of the hygienic metaphor, in Zola’s phrase, but it is never clear whether she is the source of the infection racing through French society or simply its most visible embodiment.

Nana’s ambiguity was crucial for the emergence of the Nana figure. (The problem of names seen in Lange’s “Common Folk” has already


surfaced: the name Anna never appears in *Nana*, emphasizing that her truth is never known.) As men and their fortunes crumble around her, Nana maintains that she has done nothing that others did not want her to do—“They go after the women, when it’s the men who demand things” (*Zola, Nana*, 456) —and Zola finally kills her with a disease that has no direct relation to her crimes.\(^{31}\) The circumstances of her death do not suggest narrative closure so much as call to mind a deus ex machina that finishes off a character who represents “the edge of the known world” for Zola, in Bernice Chitnis’s phrase (*Dezalay*, 121; Chitnis, 87). The closing image of Nana’s abandoned corpse, her hair the color of the sun streaming out from a slowly liquefying face, evokes, more than anything, horror over what she might mean (*Zola, Nana*, 474–75). The turn away from meaning leaves the character open to reinterpretation. It should not be surprising, then, that Nana’s final solitude, a sign of her ambiguity, became a characteristic motif of the Nana figure.

**Tengai’s Oshun**

Kosugi Tengai’s *New Year’s Finery* announces its ties to *Nana* by reproducing key elements of Zola’s novel. The title, which might also be translated as *First Glimpse*, immediately establishes a stress on vision that helps, as in *Nana*, structure the narrative.\(^{32}\) Like *Nana*, *New Year’s Finery* introduces its major characters in a scene set in a theater. The heroine, Oshun, has risen from a humble background to become a singer of *kiyomoto-bushi*, a type of narrative music derived from kabuki. A spectacular performance transforms her into an object of desire. Assumed to have easy morals because her art is associated with brothels, she negotiates social expectations regarding sex and marriage, as Nana defies them. Finally, Oshun, like Nana, suffers both social and nar-

\(^{31}\) Despite the possibility of semantic displacement between *la petite vérole* and *la vérole*, smallpox and syphilis, it is difficult to see Nana’s demise as a direct result of her deeds, much less as emblematic of a reconstituted social order, as some critics assert. See Schor, 103; and Charles Bernheimer, *Figures of Ill Repute: Representing Prostitution in Nineteenth-Century France* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1997), 218, 224.

\(^{32}\) *Hatsu sugata* refers to clothing worn during the new year’s holiday, that is, to one’s first appearance of the year. *Sugata* alone can be translated as “form” or “figure” in the sense of outward appearance.
rative retribution for her assertion of independence. *New Year's Finery* differs from *Nana* in important ways, however, and therefore we should consider the explicit parallels not elements simply borrowed from Zola but the foundation for exploring the possibilities of the Nana figure.

Tengai was a satirical writer of modest fame when he discovered an English translation of *Nana* in a Tokyo used bookstore in 1898. Although he had heard of Zola's work, reading *Nana* furnished him, by his account, with enormous insight into problems of realistic mimesis with which he had struggled for years. Tengai sought a way forward from the so-called novel of misery (*hisan shōsetsu*), a dominant genre of sentimental social fiction in the mid-1890s, because he thought that its moralistic narrative presence impeded the representation of social reality. Inspired by the precise descriptions of characters and their milieus in *Nana* and other works by Zola, Tengai began a series of documentary sketches. *New Year's Finery*, one of the first full-length narratives in the early "Zolaist" period of naturalism in Japan, continued this project through careful attention to interior spaces, urban geography, dress, and manners. It was the first of four novels that Tengai planned on Oshun's life and loves.

As in *Nana*, a number of ideas and styles of representation concerning women and sexuality in *New Year's Finery* contribute to the production of the heroine. The literature of prostitution in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries offered many examples of characters caught between the demands of profession, family, and love. (Although pursued for her talent and beauty, Oshun reserves her tenderest feelings for a young man she met working in a factory.) Beginning in the 1870s, independent, destructive women became ubiquitous in reportage and fiction, from the "poison woman" (*dokufu*) in accounts of sexually tinged murders, to the girl student Osei in Futabatei Shimei's novel

---


34 He finished only two more: *Love and Love* (*Koi to koi*, 1901) and *Imitation Purple* (*Nise murasaki*, 1905).

The Drifting Cloud (Ukigumo, 1886–89), to the aspiring writer Yoshiko in Tayama Katai’s naturalist novella The Quilt (Futon, 1907). In many such characters the freedom to move outside the home is linked to uncontrolled sexuality. New Year’s Finery also taps into official alarm over the fame that female musicians gained after a ban on performances outside brothel districts was lifted in 1877. By the end of the century these performers were selling out halls in Tokyo; their fans included rival groups of young men, which perhaps explains the shouting matches that break out during Oshun’s debut. (Some spectators call her a “goddess,” others a “man-killer” and “whore queen.”) The sexual virtue of such performers was a matter of constant doubt for the authorities, who considered them a threat to the audience’s moral health.

New ideas and institutions concerning virginity, monogamy, and prostitution that appear in New Year’s Finery place Oshun between the moral poles of virtuous and fallen women. Beginning in 1876, a system for regulating prostitution based mainly on Parent-Duchâtelet’s model introduced medical examinations and police monitoring of businesses and women suspected of engaging in unlicensed sex work. An overlay of Confucian filial piety established family poverty as the only grounds for a license—an interesting condition, considering that Oshun takes to the stage and later marries a usurer to provide for her parents and sister (Tengai, 50–51). The regulated prostitute was distinguished from the unlicensed sex worker but also from the virgin and the monogamous wife. (Shōjo or “virgin” had previously meant an unmarried young woman but now gained the meaning of sexual inexperience.) Idealized virginity and monogamy were part of a redefinition of family relations seen in the law, hygiene, and the extension of


Confucian moral norms from social elites to the populace as a whole, that is, in an establishment of modern "traditionalism" that pervades Oshun's efforts to pursue her art while resisting sexual advances and also showing the expected devotion to her parents.  

The literary and nonliterary elements that intersect around Oshun define not who she is, as they define Nana, but who she can become. The seemingly subtle departure reveals a significant shift from narrative discourse toward character when the Nana figure is extracted from Zola's novel. A number of characters in New Year's Finery, as in Nana, ponder the question "Who is Oshun?" They include the usurer, Onooka, and a young banker, Takiyama, who vie to become Oshun's patron, as well as a rich woman named Tamae, unmarried and possibly a nymphomaniac, who has designs on Ryūtarō, Oshun's sweetheart from the factory. (Oshun's feelings for him recall Nana's intermittent affection for Georges.) Discussions of Oshun frequently turn to the anomaly that she is pretty and talented yet unattached to a man and apparently a virgin (Tengai, 8–9, 18–21, 29–30, 48–49). Kasada, a journalist, observes that she is "a contradiction from beginning to end," while Bun'yū, a comedian who helps Onooka, says that she will not be able to stay one for long (Tengai, 20–21, 51–52). The uncertainty of Oshun's identity also appears in the gap between her public and domestic lives. (Invited to perform privately for Onooka after her first show, Oshun demurs on the grounds that her mother is waiting for her at home [Tengai, 56].) In the ensuing competition over Oshun, all of the major characters try to pin down her social position as she moves between various professional venues and the home. Often their attempts are accompanied by the act of looking. The visual objectification of Oshun helps focalize the narrative.  

---


in Tengai’s novel, as in Zola’s, but also gains the meaning of projected expectations. Not only the characters of New Year’s Finery but also its narrative fixes its gaze on Oshun so as to fix her identity.

Oshun’s name, like the names of other Nana figures, compounds her social ambiguity. Written Japanese uses Chinese ideographs and two phonetic syllabaries, and numerous combinations can designate the same sounds. When Oshun’s mother and others who know Oshun in a domestic context speak her name, it appears in the text as お俊; when those, like Takiyama and Kasada, who know her as a performer speak it, it appears as 小しひる—again “Oshun,” but inscribed differently. The latter variation faintly echoes the professional names of prostitutes and entertainers in brothel districts. The only characters in whose dialogue both inscriptions appear—Bun’yu; Oshun’s accompanist, Kiyoji; and Tamae—are the ones most actively trying to transform Oshun from a young innocent into a sexually bound woman, that is, to turn お俊 into 小しひる (Tengai, 18–19, 37, 46, 79, 98–99, 106, 159). Bun’yu and Kiyoji seek to persuade Oshun’s mother to sell her to a patron, while Tamae attempts to drive Oshun away from Ryūtarō so that she can have her way with him. Although Oshun focalizes the narrative, both forms of the name appear in the narration, reflecting that her social position remains unsettled until events finally force her to marry (Tengai, 36, 84). The unruliness of this Nana figure extends to her relations with the text.

Oshun is not completely at liberty to defy such ascriptions of identity. Instead she negotiates a position in the tightening web of ideas and institutions through which others (and the narrative) try to define her. One evening Oshun and Ryūtarō discover that they have been taken to the same inn by Takiyama and Tamae; they flee to a restaurant in their neighborhood. As they spend a chaste moment together, a policeman bursts in, arresting them on suspicion of prostitution (Tengai, 125–27). (Presumably the charge is working without a license, for which Nana barely escapes arrest.) Thereafter Oshun’s fate unfolds dramatically. She avoids scandal because Kasada suppresses the news of her arrest. When she dines with him to express her gratitude, however, he forces her to drink herself unconscious, then rapes her. To his blithe apology, she responds, “Because of you, my entire life is a waste,” a reference to losing the virginity that had been her only proof that she was not the
prostitute many had assumed her to be (Tengai, 133). No longer chaste, she faces increasing pressure to become Takiyama's mistress, while others conspire to keep her apart from Ryūtarō. By chance Oshun learns that she is adopted and therefore bears an especially deep obligation to her impoverished parents. She uses the remnants of her freedom to arrange a marriage with Onooka under terms that provide a comfortable home for them. On the day of her wedding she walks pensively into the countryside, seemingly defiant despite her fate, in a scene that alludes to Nana's final solitude.

The rape that signals the beginning of Oshun's enclosure recalls the symbolic excess of Nana's demise. Oshun's story, however, follows an arc nearly opposite that of Nana, who shrugs off restraint with increasing ease and finally is eliminated from the world by other means. Oshun begins in freedom—unlike the overdetermined Nana, she has only one fundamental trait, the ability to create music—but she ends bound by social conventions crafted precisely to block her aspirations. Two essential changes allow the creation of Oshun, figure of brutally thwarted ambitions, out of Nana, rancorous agent of social decay. The theories of heredity and the overt hygienic metaphors that define Nana are all but absent from Oshun's story. Although her father is an alcoholic and her family lives in poverty, the revelation of her adoption severs any hereditary connection between her disposition and these circumstances. (This seems the only reason for the odd detail that she was adopted.) While theories of hygiene are part of the sexual regime that binds her, moreover, Oshun is not a symbol of disease. That these aspects of Nana make no appearance in New Year's Finery is not altogether surprising, because Tengai was primarily interested in Zola's techniques of mimesis, not in his efforts to deploy natural and social science in fiction (Wada, 14–17). As deterministic explanations of Oshun's behavior recede, however, her capacity as a performer comes to the fore: until others can define her, she is only what she does. Unlike Nana, whose career reveals the hypocrisy of the society that created her, Oshun encounters troubles that testify to a basic conflict between the freedom to create one's identity and a repressive social order. Such a romantic view of the individual, common in Japanese naturalism, responds to changes in social relations that culminated in an ideological consolidation whose traces can be found in other turn-
of the century works of fiction.41 Yet the stress on performance when Tengai turns the theatrically inept Nana into the talented singer Oshun is typical of Nana narratives that appeared elsewhere. The transformations of Nana found in New Year’s Finery were inspired not only by conditions in Japan but also by untapped possibilities in Zola’s novel that intrigued writers in other parts of the world.

Dreiser’s Carrie

Although Theodore Dreiser said that he had read none of Zola’s novels before writing Sister Carrie, its parallels with Nana have intrigued critics for decades. Like Nana, Carrie comes from modest origins but is repelled by the factory labor that seems to be her lot; she finds material comfort as a kept woman and admirers when she takes to the stage; her story is told as a series of relationships with men; she ends the novel alone. H. L. Mencken speculated that Zola had influenced Dreiser through an intermediary. Indeed, a “second-degree” genealogy is plausible, because works of French naturalism were well known in the United States when Dreiser composed Sister Carrie. One candidate for such an intermediary is a colleague of Dreiser’s at the St. Louis Globe-Democrat who lent him an unpublished novel with elements reminiscent of Nana and of the central section of Balzac’s Last Illusions (Illusions perdues, 1837–43). By Dreiser’s account, the manuscript was his introduction to literary realism.42

Sister Carrie’s many discordant voices—a topic of much critical interest, if not irritation—suggest another source for the parallels with Nana. Dreiser’s narrator speaks variously as a sentimental moralist, a hard-nosed reporter, a social historian, and a chronicler of high-society glitz.43 The different voices echo contemporary debates about female


consumption and labor, the challenge that unmarried but sexually active women posed to norms of domesticity, and the nature of subjective identity. In the background there was a general sense of alarm that led the sexuality of women to be treated as a problem illuminating every other.\textsuperscript{44} Carrie is born of the intersection of these debates and the modes of representing women and the city that supported them, including many that shape Nana and Oshun. Some elements, such as Confucian filiality and the language of hygiene, have disappeared, while new ones, such as psychological theories of imitation, play an important role. Carrie shows a kinship with Nana and Oshun not necessarily because of a direct line of influence from Zola to Dreiser but because the intellectual, political, and economic currents that produced her resemble those that produced her sisters.

Cautionary novels about young women negotiating the world’s moral hazards were one source for a character like Carrie, who, moving from a small town to Chicago, briefly passes through her sister’s household but soon is at large in the city. The novels of Laura Jean Libbey, sentimental tales of girls who struggle to make a living in the city while fending off amorous men, and those of Bertha Clay and Albert Ross, frequently about poor brides trying to prove their worth in rich families, gave Dreiser elements of the plot, characters, and tone of \textit{Sister Carrie}.\textsuperscript{45} Moralistic fiction had a social-scientific counterpart in efforts to monitor and reform working-class women. As industrial capitalism created new opportunities to earn wages, young women increasingly worked and socialized outside the parental home, leaving them vulnerable, some thought, to pregnancy out of wedlock, venereal disease, and prostitution.\textsuperscript{46} This spectral “unattached woman,” as Priscilla Wald names her, was more anonymous than the politically active New Woman, and her behavior more difficult to determine (90–91).


Efforts to establish and study the social type were inseparable from the moral panic she occasioned. Like the young woman who worried reformers, Carrie seeks factory work as soon as she arrives in Chicago. Alerted to the attractions of the nighttime city by a glimpse from her train, she soon asks about the theater, a source of entertainment favored by working-class youth. The narrator explains that her interest springs from a “craving for pleasure” “so strong it was the one stay of her nature,” and in this way the association of wage work, the city, and unrestrained sexuality is completed (Dreiser, 6–7, 23–24). In contrast to the mythically proportioned Nana, whom Muffat describes as “the monster of the scriptures” (Zola, *Nana*, 226), Carrie effectively merges with a social type that was hotly debated at the time.

The enterprise of social investigation underlay other techniques of representation and theories of behavior that helped create Carrie. Investigations such as Jacob Riis’s *How the Other Half Lives* (1890) and Robert Woods’s *Poor in Great Cities* (1895) built a rhetoric of urban degradation that appears in the sections of *Sister Carrie* that concern the fall of Hurstwood, Carrie’s second lover. Other remarkable scenes operate in a style that Carrie Tirado Bramen calls the “urban picturesque,” which Dreiser practiced as a journalist in the 1890s.47 Dreiser places Carrie in chic restaurants and on fashionable New York streets that are venues for self-display. Walking on Broadway, she finds herself “stared at and ogled”; longing to feel “the delight of parading here as an equal,” she vows to transform herself (Dreiser, 226–27). A “naturally imitative” personality (Dreiser, 79) assists the self-transformation, revealing the contribution of new theories of psychology to the proposition of Carrie. The French sociologist Gabriel Tarde, whose work James Mark Baldwin introduced to the United States in the 1890s, held that imitation was a universal faculty explaining psychology and social relations. In *Mental Development in the Child and the Race* (1894), Baldwin argues that imitation is “the soul of our social relationships,”48 and indeed it is the soul of Carrie’s. Finally, Carrie’s intuitive understanding of the role of jewelry

---


and clothing in transformative imitation recalls commentary on the emerging culture of consumption, particularly the theory of “pecuniary emulation” that Thorstein Veblen elaborated in *The Theory of the Leisure Class* (1899). The dynamic relationship between Carrie and her environment compounds the sense that she lacks fixed qualities and relativizes norms of behavior, which she chooses depending on whether they are enabling or restrictive rather than whether they are moral.

Carrie’s rise to theatrical fame is no coincidence. When *Sister Carrie* appeared, acting was both a common metaphor for identity formation and a profession through which highly visible women fought for economic and social independence. Yet her career also recalls an aspect of *New Year’s Finery*, inasmuch as a relatively unimportant part of Nana—her comical efforts to be an actress—becomes a central quality of Carrie’s character. Her existence as a performer on- and offstage likewise inspires numerous attempts to fix her social identity. They have a different meaning than in *New Year’s Finery*, however, where the viselike diminishment of potential identities signals the death of individual freedom. From the moment Carrie encounters her first lover, Drouet, on the train to Chicago, she is willing to be almost anyone she is asked to be. The rare cases when she is not reveal the principle at work. Carrie rejects only identities that would prevent her from changing again, such as the parsimonious wage earner that her sister wishes her to be in Chicago or the self-sacrificing wife that Hurstwood demands after his flight to New York. In this light, her rejection of the town of her birth, unseen in the novel, suggests less a decision to be someone else than a desire for the freedom to be anyone else. If this essentially prospective quality leads Carrie to embrace a “cosmopolitan standard of virtue” (as the novel’s opening passage warns [Dreiser, 1]), her doing so does not necessarily make her morally worse (as it predicts).


ships of seeing and being seen through which Carrie creates herself are the very basis of the freedom she seeks, in contrast to the symptoms of social disease or acts of interpellation that such relationships are in *Nana* and *New Year's Finery*. While there is no “real” Carrie—Dreiser’s association of acting with an essentialized female inauthenticity cannot be ignored—she remains free, for the same reason, from the many false identities around her.

Carrie’s acceptance of nearly all identities but attachment to none makes names a problem in *Sister Carrie*, as they are in other Nana narratives. In Dreiser’s novel, however, no one asks, “Who is Carrie?”—not because her identity is self-evident but because there are many Carries separately acceptable to her interlocutors. The question of who Carrie is may not even be posable for lack of a stable referent. Her original surname, Meeber, appears only at the outset; afterward she moves under the surnames Drouet, Murdock (the name Hurstwood uses when passing through Montreal), Wheeler (his name in New York), and Madenda, her stage name for a Chicago production that she revives on Broadway. Onstage she is Laura, Katisha the Country Maid, and the Little Quakeress, among others, while in the narrative she receives such epithets as “the little toiler,” “the little dramatic student,” and the unusually judgmental “little soldier of fortune.” Names proliferate until the differences among them disappear (Dreiser, 37, 45, 116, 120, 322, 327; Fisher, 160–62). “Nana” names a physical body that entrances the world with its vagina, not with its acting, as Zola’s narrator observes several times (*Nana*, 49, 445, 457). Although the name is meaningless, Nana’s ghastly death shows that she remains confined to the body that bears it. In *New Year’s Finery* and *Sister Carrie*, in contrast, escaping names per se means the difference between social confinement and self-determination. While Oshun ultimately is defined as 小しΨん, Carrie frees herself from naming.

The long-disputed closing scene of *Sister Carrie*, featuring the recurring image of Carrie in a rocking chair, looking out the window at the street, suggests a final escape from the expectations that others have projected on her. Like Nana and Oshun, however, she seems punished by the narrative for resisting. In the final scene the voice of the sentimental moralist of the novel’s opening returns in force, asserting that misguided “longing for that which is better” has directed the steps of
Carrie’s “erring” and insinuating that she is unhappy and disillusioned. Yet the passage seems to acknowledge that, having escaped a series of spurious identities pushed on her by others, she is not susceptible to conventional condemnation. The novel’s final lines, addressed directly to Carrie—“Know, then, that for you is neither surfeit or content. . . . In your rocking-chair, by your window, shall you dream such happiness as you may never feel”—emphasize the prospective orientation of Carrie’s self even as they withdraw fulfillment from her, leaving her free if not yet anyone (Dreiser, 368–69). Like the endings of New Year’s Finery and Nana—and indeed of Balzac’s Old Goriot (Père Goriot, 1835), which Carrie reads—that of Sister Carrie associates solitude with defiance. The final obstacle to Carrie’s increasingly conscious desire to invent herself, however, appears not in the story—as Nana’s smallpox and the machinations Oshun faces do in Nana and New Year’s Finery—but in the narrator’s voice. Perhaps for this reason, the narrative retribution that Carrie suffers is more histrionic, yet less consequential, than what Nana and Oshun experience. In contrast to Nana’s death and Oshun’s rape, the loneliness that the narrator says is Carrie’s lot is an inward component of self-discovery, not a circumstance imposed from without.

**Formal Transpositions and Minimal Structure**

The resemblances among Nana, Oshun, and Carrie show that the Nana figure is not a fixed type but a cluster of qualities in shifting relationship with each other. From a range of characteristics, including an urban existence, an instrumental attitude toward marriage, and an unrepentant view of her own acts, one can distill three that are fundamental: stage performance, the ability to inspire contagious infatuation, and social mobility that lets the heroine resist ascriptions of identity. That these qualities can combine and recombine with others explains why the Nana figure could address matters as different as the moral hypocrisies of the Second Empire in France, the reorganization of marriage and sexual labor in Meiji Japan, and the emergence of a culture of consumption and the transformation of domesticity during the Gilded Age in the United States.

The Nana figure’s malleability resulted from specific changes that allowed Nana to take flight from Zola’s novel. In particular, as the mas-
ter metaphor of hygiene is replaced by one of performance, Oshun and Carrie gain a more dynamic relationship to the societies around them than Nana has to her world. The way they express self-consciousness is one sign. While Nana has little subjectivity beyond what is expressed by the phrase “I want,” Oshun and Carrie show a strong though mainly negative sense of self that might be phrased as “I am not.” Changes in plot follow from the change in character. The ability of Oshun and Carrie to perform inspires the conflicts over their social identities that structure their stories, while their resistance to ascriptions of identity moves each story to its end. The themes of New Year’s Finery and Sister Carrie shift accordingly, from the relatively limited argument on social rot in Nana—a corrupt society creates its perfect enabler—to more open-ended considerations of the conflict between individual freedom and social restrictions.

The structuralist poetics that has dominated work on Zola since the 1970s tends to treat characters like Nana as manifestations of a novel’s organic structure. If this were so, it should have been difficult to remove Nana from the structure that produced her. Yet the Nana figure began to be extracted from Nana even before the novel was serialized, and quickly became ubiquitous in mass culture. One reason is that Nana was not wholly original but the product of theories of social behavior and techniques for representing it that were themselves circulating transnationally. Because the Nana figure differed from Zola’s heroine, however, this explanation is not enough. The Nana figure was not simply lifted free of Nana by the constellation of ideas around it.

We might ask whether the Nana figure also traveled widely because certain aspects of Nana’s dense narrative discourse, where the novel’s descriptive and figurative social anatomy is centered, could be transposed into aspects of the Nana figure as character. Such “formal transpositions” would proceed through shifts in the theories and techniques of representation at work in the novels in which she appears. Performance becomes a quality of the Nana figure when several episodes in Nana, important as illustrations of her audience’s corruption, yield a basic trait of Oshun’s and Carrie’s personae. It becomes all the more central as the theories of heredity that limit what Nana can become

52 An example is Schor’s structuralist reading of Nana, which argues that the novel reenacts a pharmakos or scapegoat myth (4—5, 109).
disappear. (Carrie’s “imitative” personality is the opposite of hereditary determination.) Contagion and mobility become essential traits through similar transpositions. The overt hygienic metaphors of Nana vanish, only to reemerge in different forms in other works. On the one hand, the Nana figure remains associated with contagious behavior, such as the obsession of fans in New Year’s Finery or the dynamics of urban crowds in Sister Carrie. On the other, Nana’s mobility, which primarily shows the decadence of the society that made her, becomes the sign of a fundamentally individual aspiration to self-determination in Oshun and Carrie. The three central traits of the Nana figure each show features of the narrative discourse of Nana moving into the Nana figure herself. The Nana figure assumes qualities that structure Nana as a whole.

Are Oshun and Carrie then characters in the conventional sense? Despite their self-consciousness, positive expressions of who they are and what they want are scarce. Performance, contagion, and mobility, moreover, are qualities of activity, not psychology, that indicate a heroine’s relationship to others. The plots that these qualities propel concern the assertion, rather than the content, of individuality. These core traits remain after a winnowing of possibilities internal to Zola’s novel. Thus the formal transposition that creates the Nana figure establishes what could be called a “minimal structure” of qualities. Although it bears several proper names—Oshun, Carrie, Nadja, Lina—this structure operates as a peripatetic social diagnostic. The transposition that establishes it undeniably flattens the complex relationship between Nana and her milieu, in which her desires seamlessly join the desire of others to satisfy them. The Nana figure has a more simply adversarial relationship to society. Yet simplification leaves the Nana figure more dynamic, not less, as demonstrated by the variety of plots she generates and the range of social criticism to which she lends herself. It was in this form that Nana traveled widely.

58 Minimization of discourses of heredity was common, too, in other parts of the world. See Gacoin-Marks, 243–44; and Borghart, 332–33.
The Opening of New Possibilities

The traits of the Nana figure are not incidental; rather, they tell us why she appears in certain contexts, or what she diagnoses. Moreover, they allow us to see what makes her different from competing icons, such as the New Woman and the rebellious daughter, two late-nineteenth-century rivals, or the twentieth-century Modern Girl. The Nana figure, as New Year’s Finery and Sister Carrie attest, is frequently associated with contradictions in the social treatment of female labor. Her qualities make her well suited to expressing such contradictions, in contrast to the problems of education and mass culture associated with the New Woman and the Modern Girl, respectively. Oshun’s and Carrie’s talents give them the economic means to move freely outside the parental household while remaining unmarried. In others’ eyes, however, their mobility is morally congruent with prostitution. Paid female labor is assumed to be sexual labor, in contrast to the unpaid domestic labor of daughter and wife. The ambiguity of Oshun’s and Carrie’s aspirations to independence follows from the dichotomy of male and female labor that was a fault line in the capitalist social relations, based on labor in the abstract, that characterized both the United States and Japan by this time. By seeking compensation for their work, Carrie and Oshun each behave as a self-interested economic subject, the ideal actor of liberal political economy, but to do so as a woman is a scandal. The young workingwoman’s rejection of unpaid labor becomes a defiance of legal and customary restraint that could spread through society. The coordinating role of capital in isolating the threat is fittingly revealed in Oshun’s forced choice between a banker and a usurer as husband.

In Zola’s novel, by contrast, society cannot fully reject Nana’s assertions of independence, because it wants to submit to her rebellion. What New Year’s Finery and Sister Carrie identify as a contradiction in liberal ideology is only a social pathology of the Second Empire in Nana. The theories of heredity in Nana, which cut against liberal views of the subject, prevent the contradiction from appearing. The properly ideological problem emerges in New Year’s Finery and Sister Carrie because the formal transposition that creates the Nana figure moves the conflict between freedom and restraint, and therefore the contradiction in the gendered organization of labor, to the novels’ centers. The Nana fig-
ure's final solitude marks the desire for independence as both aberrant and genuine; the source of the conflict is the refractory structure of social relations and cannot be resolved by eliminating an individual or a social type. While the Nana figure's ubiquity might suggest an all-purpose female demon, clearly she expresses a form of moral panic most likely to arise in capitalist societies.

Thus the Nana figure enabled authors to explore social and philosophical problems that are absent, or at best submerged, in Zola's novel. What at first seems derivative variation in fact is the opening of new possibilities. The career of the Nana figure therefore demands that we reconsider conventional ideas of originality when thinking about the movement of works or genres outside their places of origin. Because the new possibilities for investigation found in New Year's Finery and Sister Carrie appeared through the formal transposition that created the Nana figure out of Nana, they probably would not have surfaced if Nana had remained in Nana, or Nana in France. The movement of Zola's novel around the world made the extraction of the Nana figure from Nana possible and, by putting her into different circumstances, promoted the appearance of versions of her that could not be predicted from Nana itself.

**Transformation and Originality**

*Nana* did not instigate the emergence of the Nana figure, because the process involved more than the reproduction of a heroine. Its crux was creating a minimal structure that passed for a character, but it also depended on the ongoing transformation of the theories and techniques for representing the social on which *Nana* drew; the geographic extension of that social imaginary to ever greater parts of the world; and the material, economic, and geopolitical changes that supported its extension (which also made the contradictions of liberal individualism a concern in places far from Europe). The process did not begin with the publication of *Nana*. Rather, the novel put its own sources into a combination that was consequential because it could be flattened and transformed into the Nana figure. *Nana* does not contain all of the Nana figure's possibilities, some of which are blocked by the theories of heredity and by the overt hygienic metaphors in the novel. Nor did
the novel solely determine her later variations, which arose also from political and economic conditions in different parts of the world.

The causes of the Nana figure's emergence are therefore complex. If the extension of capitalism from Europe to other parts of the world introduced new contradictions into existing social structures, one can identify a structural causality in which the unevenness of the capitalist world system fostered variations of the Nana figure that expressed, symptomatically, economic and ideological fault lines in different locales. The movement of the naturalist novel and its fellow travelers around the world in the late nineteenth century also was crucial. Although Nana was not the sole source of the Nana figure, Zola's novel certainly provided ready material for her. Finally, authors played a key role, structural causes notwithstanding. If the Nana figure was a social diagnostic, novelists from Zola to Tengai, Dreiser, and on were the pathologists. Nonetheless, even in the case of Zola, transformation rather than origination was the crucial activity. Indeed, one might call the heroines that appeared after Nana's publication "iterations" of the Nana figure, to stress that they are variations without an original. Reversing the perspective and considering Nana in light of the characters that followed her, one might recognize her as the first such iteration, in that she shares the qualities of the minimal structure, albeit in a less explicit configuration. If the Nana figure exists only in its variations, criticism that maps the world using literary "mean times" is fundamentally mistaken not only about the ways in which European literary forms traveled but also about their manifestation in Europe.

The travels of Nana provide important lessons for the study of the movement of literary forms in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Counter to the tendency in current scholarship to focus on literature alone, the history of the Nana figure shows the importance of tracing the combinations, travels, and recombinations of the ideas and techniques of representation that contribute to the literary text. The career of the Nana figure also teaches us to watch for formal transformations that happen on the move, such as the transposition of aspects of nar-

rative discourse into qualities of character. The ways that such transformations open the Nana figure to possibilities unrealized in Zola's novel reveal that conventional views of originality (and of the originary power of Europe) may impede our understanding of the development of form in flight. Above all, the history of the Nana figure teaches us to ground our investigations of the literature of the world in the political and economic history of the planet. It is to the planet that the protean icon of the Nana figure belongs.

Appendix: Selected Editions of Nana

The appendix lists the earliest book editions for which publisher, place of publication, or translator could be confirmed. (Also included are additional English, German, and Portuguese editions mentioned in the essay.) I welcome information on earlier translations and translations into other languages (clh20@columbia.edu).

_Nana_. Paris: Charpentier, 1880.


_Nana_ [Modern Greek]. Trans. Flox [Ioannis Kambouroglou], 1880.


Nama [Dutch]. Amsterdam: Smit, 1900.
Nama [Serbo-Croatian]. Trans. I. Dimitrijevic and Sare M. Belgrade: Izdanje Sveslovenske knjizare M. J. Stefanovic i drug, 1920s.
Nama: roman [Latvian]. (Riga?): Vainags, 1930s.
Nama [Icelandic]. Trans. Karl Ísfeld. [Reykjavík]: Blaahringurinn, 1941.


